

Role Models as Moral Means of Persuasion in Apocalyptic Literature

Emmanouil Gkinidis

Democritus University of Thrace

Abstract

Apocalyptic texts are teeming with moral teachings and ethical values, which make up the very core of their messages, acting like a mantle that caresses and bonds together all the parts of the narrative and moves the plot by justifying events, thoughts and actions. Apocalyptic discourse, as every other form of religious and philosophical speech, aspires to teach its recipients about the moral way of life and persuade them about the importance of remaining virtuous and ethically just, avoiding at the same time everything bad or unethical. As a product of the restless political and social environment of the Hellenistic-Roman period, apocalyptic texts attempt to remind their recipients of the ethical values which they had acquired from their religious and philosophical *paideia*, a recurrence of moral lessons that it is urgently necessary to remain faithful to. These are mostly presented as ‘role models’, that is, examples of thinking and acting which are meant to be imitated or avoided, followed always by the reward or punishment that results from divine judgement. From the examination of their various forms, it is concluded that they entirely correspond with the moral teachings which can be located in any work of the same literary tradition, while the obvious predominance of the negative role models over the positive ones attests to their perfect accordance with the moral teachings of both Jewish-Christian and classical texts.

Keywords: apocalyptic, ethics, morals, emotions, discourse, erotapokriseis

In *Rhetorica* 1355b, Aristotle most definitely sets the main purpose of Rhetoric, which is simultaneously its generative principle; persuasion. Nevertheless, in spite of the tremendous value of his work, the notion of and need for persuasion are much older and exceed the narrow geographical borders of ancient Greece. Nearly every literary work of the southeastern Mediterranean discloses its persuasive nature, more or less evidently, persuasion being a task that became ever more wide and profound in later times due to the cosmopolitan character of the

Hellenistic and Roman world.¹ As a direct product of the restless political and social environment of these periods, apocalyptic literature managed to stand aside as a separate literary genre in Israel, uniquely combining visual and picturesque motifs that go beyond Jewish philosophical and religious beliefs and constitute a ‘common grammar’ among the civilizations of southeastern Mediterranean and Middle East². The goal of this paper is not to offer an exhaustive catalogue of role models that can be located in every apocalyptic text, but to highlight their crucial role in the persuasion attempted by the writers in question throughout their apocalyptic narrative, being a vital tool of apocalyptic rhetoric in general. For this purpose, the examination that follows comprises the role models found in a number of selected texts

As the youngest phase of apocalyptic studies, research on the function of apocalyptic discourse was begun in the 1980s by Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza and Adela Yarbro Collins,³ while the systematic examination of the rhetorical nature of apocalyptic discourse peaked during the next two decades⁴. This examination flourished in 1999, when Greg Carey offered the most detailed definition of apocalyptic discourse to date. According to him, apocalyptic discourse refers to a

¹ See Porter, Stanley E. 1997. (ed.) *Handbook of Classical Rhetoric in the Hellenistic Period: 330 B.C. – A.D. 400*, Leiden / New York / Köln: Brill, for the various rhetorical techniques and *topoi* that writers of different literary works use during the Hellenistic-roman era.

² Two of the most significant works of contemporary apocalyptic studies are those by Collins, John J. 1979 (ed.) *Apocalypse: The Morphology of a Genre* [Semeia 14], Atlanta: Scholars Press, and Carey, Greg and Gregory L. Bloomquist 1999 (ed.) *Vision and Persuasion: Rhetorical Dimensions of Apocalyptic Discourse*, St. Louis: Chalice Press. In the first, Collins offers the most accurate definition of the apocalyptic genre, broadening the very base of what was considered apocalyptic at the time, and highlighting the apocalyptic character of texts that belong to other literatures besides the Jewish and Christian (9), while in the introduction of the latter, Carey set out the characteristics of apocalyptic *topoi*, which rely solely on pictures and motifs as the main tools of apocalyptic rhetoric and discourse. Furthermore, the rhetorical function of apocalyptic discourse is the main theme of research of an unpublished doctoral dissertation by Gkinidis, Emmanouil N. 2017 *The Loneliness of the Prophet: Narrative Techniques and Emotional Manipulation in Apocalyptic Discourse*, Democritus University of Thrace; Department of Greek Literature, the results of which manifest the apocalyptic writers’ focus on the manipulation of the recipients’ emotions, aiming at the successful acceptance of the truth of their messages by them.

³ Schüssler Fiorenza, Elisabeth 1983. “The Phenomenon of Early Christian Apocalyptic. Some Reflections on Method”, *Apocalypticism in the Mediterranean World and the Near East: Proceedings of the International Colloquium on Apocalypticism, Uppsala, August 12-17, 1979* (edited by David Hellholm), Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 295-316, and Yarbro Collins, Adela 1984. *Crisis and Catharsis: The Power of the Apocalypse*, Philadelphia: Westminster. However, interest concerning the characteristics of the apocalyptic language and discourse seems to be rather older – see, especially, DiTommaso, Lorenzo 2007. “Apocalypses and Apocalypticism in Antiquity (Part 1)”, *CBR* 5.2, 247-250, for the history of research on this matter.

⁴ See, indicatively, Yarbro Collins, Adela 1999. “Apocalyptic Themes in Biblical Literature”, *Interpretation* 53.2, 117-130, O’Leary, Stephen D. 1994. *Arguing the Apocalypse: A Theory of Millennial Rhetoric*, Oxford: Oxford University Press and Carey and Bloomquist 1999.

constellation of *topoi*, which aim at the persuasion of the recipients.⁵ As in the case of classical Rhetoric, *topoi* are a kind of communal arguments that both writers and readers / listeners used during the process of disclosing and delivering a message: a writer uses an apocalyptic *topos* which encloses the message that he wants to offer, while the recipient decodes the form of this *topos*, receiving and interpreting at the same time the message of the writer.

This brief reference to the rhetorical structure of apocalyptic discourse seems to be the most appropriate introduction to the subject of this paper, which rests upon the very need for apocalyptic writing. At the center of every apocalyptic composition lie the messages of the writer, which are presented in the form of instructions, advice, hopeful promises or consoling words. The variety among the forms, structures and compositions of these messages is the product of the unique nature of every one of them; however, apart from the different triggers behind each apocalyptic creation, every message stands firmly on moral ground. Being profoundly philosophical and religious in character, apocalyptic texts are teeming with moral teachings and ethical values that make up the very core of their messages, acting like a mantle that caresses and bonds together all the parts of the narrative and moves the plot by justifying events, thoughts and actions.

As the central part of every apocalyptic message, moral teachings attempt to persuade the recipients about the importance of remaining virtuous and ethically just, avoiding at the same time everything bad or unethical. Particularly, they act as a reminder of the ethical values which they had acquired from their religious and philosophical *paideia*, a repetition of moral lessons that it is highly necessary to remain faithful to.⁶ In this attempt, they choose not to provide a limited analysis of moral values, followed by the positive or negative repercussions that they may have on the recipient, but they seem to delve into the very meaning of morality and immorality. Consequently, ~~are~~ issues of reward or punishment can be found in every section of apocalyptic narrative; through

⁵ Carey, Greg. 1999. "Introduction: Apocalyptic Discourse, Apocalyptic Rhetoric", *Vision and Persuasion: Rhetorical Dimensions of Apocalyptic Discourse* (ed. by Greg Carey and Gregory L. Bloomquist), St. Louis: Chalice Press, 10.

⁶ See Allison, Dale C. Jr 2014. "Apocalyptic Ethics and Behavior", *The Oxford Handbook of Apocalyptic Literature* (edited by John J. Collins), Oxford: Oxford University Press, 295-311, especially 296; the value of these lessons is emphasized and amplified by the eschatological fears of impending judgement that run through the apocalyptic narrative. Furthermore, this urgent and valuable nature of morality of any kind is highlighted by the images and motifs that make up the descriptions of otherworldly judgement, in other words, by the main tools of apocalyptic rhetoric themselves – on this matter, see also Bauckham, Richard 1998. *The Fate of the Dead: Studies on the Jewish and Christian Apocalypses*, Leiden / Boston / Köln: Brill, 89.

these, writers manage to enhance the clarity and lucidity of their teachings, leaving no room for misunderstanding of the meaning of their message.

Before focusing on the examination of the nature and character of the role models that can be traced inside apocalyptic narrative, a definition of the term is necessary; as 'role models' are considered those references and reports of ethical values and actions which are always followed by the mention of the reward or punishment that comes as a result, through divine judgement. Being part of the moral teachings that run throughout the narrative in its entirety, they stand out as the clearest manifestation of them, speaking to the mind of the faithful recipients and appealing to their sense of religious commitment in the most direct and honest way; due to the dynamic nature of their role they constitute the culmination of a continuous effort for persuasion.

Starting with the positive role models, they are presented as examples of thinking and acting that should be imitated by the recipients, with special reference to the rewards that follow every good, just and moral act or thought. According to their social role and impact, they can be divided into two categories, the first containing all of those that affect the relationship between the individual and society, while the second is composed of those that characterize his/her relationship with religion. As far as the first category is concerned, the following role models can be located:

- Hospitality (Xenia): In *Frogs* 454-460, the chorus of the initiates mentions that they have achieved salvation thanks to their good behavior towards strangers; In *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.10 and 104.2, hospitality is referred to as an action that should be offered generously by the faithful and the priests alike; in *Testament of Jacob* 3.19, this value is one of many others that are rewarded, in *Apocalypse of Paul* 27, those who offer hospitality earn their place to the northern side of the city of the righteous, next to the river of wine. Moreover, the value of hospitality is further emphasized by the punishments associated with its absence; thus, in *Frogs* 145-150, those who have done wrong to a stranger lay in the swamp of Hades and in *Apocalypse of Paul* 40, Paul attends the horrible punishments of those who have never entertained a guest or stranger.
- Justice: In *2Enoch* 9.1, the angelic guide shows Enoch the place destined for those who are just, and in *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.10, justice is one of those actions that leads to salvation.
- Philanthropy: In any texts located, philanthropy is presented in the form of feeding the poor, clothing the naked, helping widows and orphans, raising those who fall down, donating wealth

to charity and, generally, of every action that makes the lives of those in need easier and themselves happier. In *2Enoch* and *Shepherd of Hermas*, these kinds of action are highly esteemed, as they appear very often in their narrative⁷, while in *Testament of Isaac*, *Testament of Jacob* and *Apocalypse of Paul* they appear as worthy of reward as well⁸. Additionally, as in the case of hospitality, the importance of philanthropy emerges through the punishments that await those who are indifferent, oppress or do not donate their wealth to those in need, a powerful message that can be found in several texts.⁹

- Respect: Another way of manifesting positive ethical values, respect, along with honor, brings rewards upon those who practice it¹⁰, as well as condemnations upon those who do not believe in it.¹¹
- Love: This highly important moral value should be manifested in every aspect of the social life of the faithful, as it triggers, or gives birth to, a set of other moral values and ethical actions. Even though it is mentioned less than other role models, it remains one of the most powerful ones and points the way to salvation to those who are characterized by it,¹² as well as the way to punishment to those who deny it.¹³
- Honesty: Along with truth, the writers of *Shepherd of Hermas* and *4Ezra* refer to them as acceptable ethical actions that are rewarded.¹⁴

⁷ *2Enoch* 9.1, 44.4-5, 50.5, 51.2, 52.7 and 63.1, and *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.10, 50.8-9, 51.9-10, 56.7, 101.2-3 and 104.2. See, also, Grundeken, Mark 2015. *Community Building in the Shepherd of Hermas: A Critical Study of Some Key Aspects* [VCSup 131], Leiden / Boston: Brill, 114-127, for the act of donating wealth to the poor as the main form of charity in *Shepherd of Hermas*.

⁸ *Testament of Isaac* 10.10,20, *Testament of Jacob* 3. 19-21 and *Apocalypse of Paul* 47.

⁹ *2Enoch* 10.4-5, *Apocalypse of Zephaniah* 2. 16-18, *Revelation* 3.15-20, *Shepherd of Hermas* 103.2, *Apocalypse of Paul* 4, 35, 39 and *Apocalypse of Peter* 9.

¹⁰ *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.10, *2Enoch* 52. 9 and *2Baruch* 66.2, while in *Asclepius* 29, respect towards God is rewarded.

¹¹ *2Enoch* 52.10, *Poimandres* 23 and *Apocalypse of Peter* 11.

¹² *2Enoch* 52. 11, *Revelation* 2.19, *Shepherd of Hermas* 16.5-7, 38.10 and 92.2, and *Asclepius* 29. In *Somnium Scipionis* 13, salvation comes through love for the homeland.

¹³ *Apocalypse of Paul* 40 and *2Baruch* 54.14, in which lack of love for the Divine Law is punished.

¹⁴ *Shepherd of Hermas* 16.5-7, 27.1-7, 28.1-5, 92.2 and 101.2-3, and *4Ezra* 7.34-35.

- Kindness: Also referred to as reverence, mercy and politeness, kindness is an appropriate and ethical form of behavior in several texts,¹⁵ while the impact of its absence is manifested in *Apocalypse of Paul*.¹⁶

Moving on to the second category, the role models that affect the relationship between the individual and religion are the following:

1. Knowledge: This is probably the most important element and objective associated with religion, as it leads to salvation through truth and wisdom. The ‘knowledge that saves’ is present in several narratives,¹⁷ but it is mostly referred to in *2Baruch*.¹⁸ In addition to its possession, the teaching of knowledge is also rewarded in *Shepherd of Hermas* 102.2 and *Testament of Levi* 12.9.
2. Self-control: Along with self-restraint, this refers to ethical deeds that reward those who act accordingly and can be located in *De genio Socratis* and *Shepherd of Hermas*.¹⁹
3. Passion in the name of God: Punishments, tortures or death due to one’s religious beliefs is one of the most influential motifs not only in apocalyptic literature but in all religious texts in general. The major impact of passion on the emotional world of the faithful recipients of the texts is featured as a very effective tool of persuasion, its significance being appreciated by several apocalyptic writers.²⁰

¹⁵ *Shepherd of Hermas* 13.1, 16.5-7, 27.1-7, 101.2 and 102.2, *Testament of Isaac* 13.6, *Apocalypse of Paul* 14, *Asclepius* 29 and *2Baruch* 44.14.

¹⁶ *Apocalypse of Paul* 16, 17, 35 and 40.

¹⁷ *De genio Socratis* 592a, *Sophia of Jesus Christ* III.117.9-118.2, *Shepherd of Hermas* 16.5-7, *Asclepius* 29 and *4Ezra* 13.55. In *Icaromenippus* 13, it is indirectly stated that Epicurus reached salvation due to his righteous way of life and philosophical beliefs.

¹⁸ *2Baruch* 44.13, 51.3,7 and 66.2.

¹⁹ *De genio Socratis* 592a, in which it is not stated directly, as it is used to describe the movements of good daemons, and *Shepherd of Hermas* 16.4 and 92.2, while in 38.11 of the same text, the lack of self-control on good deeds is rewarded.

²⁰ *Revelation* 5.9-10, 7.9-17 and 20.4, *Shepherd of Hermas* 9.9, 10.1, 13.2, 69.6-7 and 105.1-6, *Apocalypse of Paul* 22, 23, 47 and 49, *Apocryphon of James* 4.32-5.36, *4Ezra* 7.88-98 and *Apocalypse of Peter* 14-20. Furthermore, in *Aeneid* VI 660, those who give their lives for the homeland gain access to Elysium. Apart from the aforementioned, the most popular form of passion, especially among the Christians and the Gnostics, is fasting and the endurance of corporal maltreatment; see Allison, “Ethics”, 302-303, on this matter.

4. Faith: Faith, along with preservation and compliance of Divine Law, is the most important role model of this category and offers salvation and rewards in many texts,²¹ especially in *Shepherd of Hermas*, *Apocalypse of Paul*, *4Ezra* and *2Baruch*.²²
5. Humility: This model of ethical behavior ensures participation in post mortem rewards in some texts.²³
6. Repentance: Another positive role model with a strong moral message to its recipients, which is located in some texts.²⁴ *Shepherd of Hermas* is the exception concerning the frequency of its reference, as repentance is the main message of this text.²⁵
7. Patience: Patience against tribulations and hardships is a rather powerful example to be imitated by the faithful recipients, as long as they wish to take part in future salvation and rewards. It is adulated in some texts,²⁶ with *Shepherd of Hermas* being the one with the most references to it.²⁷
8. Purity: The ethically prominent model of purity, innocence and virginity is reported in few texts.²⁸ in *Revelation*, in which it is mentioned only once,²⁹ in *Apocalypse of Paul*, occurring

²¹ *Dialogue of the Savior* 128.22-24, *2Enoch* 52.1,3,5, *Revelation* 2.19 and 3.9-10, *Testament of Isaac* 1.4, *Testament of Jacob* 3.21, *Asclepius* 11 and 29, and *Jubilees* 23.26-31.

²² *Shepherd of Hermas* 13.1-4, 16.3, 23.4, 46.1, 73.6 and 92.2, *Apocalypse of Paul* 25, 28, 29 and 47, *4Ezra* 7.17,34-35,131, 9.7-8 and 13.54-56, and *2Baruch* 44.14-15, 51.3-5, 54.21, 66.1-6 and 77.7.

²³ *2Enoch* 50.2 and 52.13, *Shepherd of Hermas* 56.7, *Apocalypse of Paul* 47, and *4Ezra* 8.49-52 and 13.53-56. Moreover, in *2Enoch* 52.14, punishment awaits him whose humility is not sincere.

²⁴ *Dialogue of the Savior* 129.13-15, *Zostrianos* 10.8-10, *Revelation* 2.5-7, 3.19-21, and *Apocalypse of Paul* 22.

²⁵ *Shepherd of Hermas* 3.2, 6.3-4,7-8, 11.2, 13.5, 15.5-6, 21.4, 25.7, 27.7, 29.7-8, 33.7, 77.3, 91.1-2, 96.3, 97.4, 98.4, 99.4, 100.5, 103.6,8 and 110.3. See, also, Grundeken, *Community Building*, 133-140, for the role of repentance in this text.

²⁶ *2Enoch* 9.1 and 50.3, *Revelation* 2.2-3,19,26-27 and 3.9-10, *Apocalypse of Paul* 47, *Book of Thomas the Contender* 145.6-9, and *2Baruch* 15.7-8 and 29.6.

²⁷ *Shepherd of Hermas* 9.9, 10.1, 38.10, 76.4 and 92.2. See Allison, "Ethics", 308, for the abstinence from violence as another manifestation of patience in hardships in apocalyptic literature.

²⁸ See Himmelfarb, Martha 1985. *Tours of Hell: An Apocalyptic Form in Jewish and Christian Literature*, Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 71 and 74, n. 3; the value of purity seems to hold an esteem position only in Christian literature and not in Jewish.

²⁹ *Revelation* 14.4.

twice,³⁰ in *Apocalypse of Peter*, in which the punishments of those who do not preserve them are described³¹ and in *Shepherd of Hermas*, a text in which it is more frequently mentioned,³²

Moving on to the examination of the unethical role models, it is discernible that they can be divided in categories as well: the first category contains those which characterize the relationship between the individual and society, the second religion, the third money, and the fourth passions and vices. The negative role models of the first category are the following:

- Murder: This reprehensible deed is located in many narratives, followed by condemnation and punishments.³³
- Hypocrisy: The lack of honesty and sincerity is presented in some texts as a way of thinking and acting that deserves punishments,³⁴ while in *Shepherd of Hermas* 104.2 the righteous are rewarded for not being hypocrites.
- Conspiracy: In *Icaromenippus* 15 and 25, and *Apocalypse of Paul* 31, the thought and deed of conspiracy, with the intention of harming his/her fellow human beings, brings condemnation upon the individual.
- Perjury: Another unethical deed worthy of condemnation and punishment, which is present in some texts.³⁵

³⁰ *Apocalypse of Paul* 22 and 26.

³¹ *Apocalypse of Peter* 26. Loss of virginity before marriage, along with abortion and infanticide, appear almost exclusively in Christian texts (see, also, Himmelfarb, *Tours of Hell*, 71-72). Infanticide, in particular, was not always ethically reproachable in ancient Greek and Roman society; on this matter, see Himmelfarb, *Tours of Hell*, 74-75 and n. 18-21, and Shanzer, Danuta 2009. "Voices and Bodies: The Afterlife of the Unborn", *Numen* 56.2/3, 326-365, especially 329-330.

³² *Shepherd of Hermas* 13.1, 16.5-7, 27.1-2,7, 29.1,10, 92.2, 102.2, 104.2 and 106.1-3. Also, see Allison, "Ethics", 301-302, on this matter.

³³ *De sera numinis vindicta* 566f, *De genio Socratis* 592d, *Πολιτεία* 615b-c, *Gnostic Apocalypse of Paul* 21.8-10, *2Enoch* 10.4-5, *Testament of Levi* 14.4 and 16.3-5, *3Baruch* 13.4, *Testament of Abraham* 10.6-10 and 12.23-33, *Revelation* 9.20-21, 18.23-24, 21.8 and 22.15, *Testament of Isaac* 7.7,11, *Apocalypse of Paul* 18 and 40, *2Baruch* 64.2-3 and 73.4-5, and *Apocalypse of Peter* 25 and 26. Also, in *Icaromenippus* 15, philosophers are accused of many crimes, killing being one of them, with their ultimate condemnation located at the end of the narrative.

³⁴ *De sera numinis vindicta* 567a-b, *Icaromenippus* 29, *Necyomantia* 5, *Questions of Bartholomew* 4.38,42,44 and 5.2-4, *Apocalypse of Peter* 6, and *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.3, 72.5-6 and 96.2-3. In *Icaromenippus* and *Necyomantia*, the condemnations of the philosophers are at the end of the text.

³⁵ *Icaromenippus* 15 and 16, *Necyomantia* 2, *Frogs* 150, *3Baruch* 13.4, *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.5 and 92.3, and *Apocalypse of Peter* 29. See Himmelfarb, *Tours of Hell*, 72, for the gravitas of sins associated with speech in ancient Greek, Jewish and Christian tradition.

- Treason: Treason against homeland, God or his/her fellow men is a deed which leads the individual to damnation and is mainly present in the texts of ancient Greek and Roman tradition,³⁶ while references to it are also located in *Shepherd of Hermas* and *4Ezra*.³⁷
- Theft: As one of the most serious crimes against society, theft is criticized by many writers.³⁸
- Lying: Also presented as mendacity or opposition to truth, this immoral value characterizes both the mentality and the unsociable behavior of an individual. It is an example to be avoided in many narratives,³⁹ with *2Enoch*, *Revelation* and *Shepherd of Hermas* having the most references to it.⁴⁰
- Slander: Slander and its related sins (mockery, gossip and insult) are widely referred to in many texts,⁴¹ along with the rewarding of the avoidance of them.⁴²
- Anger: This negative emotion and way of thought is excoriated by many writers along with its physical manifestations (rivalry and quarrel),⁴³ while the avoidance of it can lead to salvation and rewards.⁴⁴

³⁶ *Icaromenippus* 15, *Republic* 615b-c and *Aeneid* VI 612-614. This role model is utterly related to love for the homeland, a connection that seems to increase its severity within ancient Greek and Roman morality.

³⁷ *Shepherd of Hermas* 72.4 and 96.1, and *4Ezra* 7.22. The severity of this offence is particularly highlighted in *Shepherd of Hermas* 96.1, in which apostates and traitors of Church are the only sinners that do not gain the right to repentance.

³⁸ *Icaromenippus* 15, 16 and 21, *Necyomantia* 2, *Sophia of Jesus Christ* BG.120.15-121.3, *2Enoch* 10.4-5, *Testament of Levi* 14.5, *3Baruch* 13.4, *Testament of Abraham* 10.6-10, *Revelation* 9.21, *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.5, 65.5 and 103.2, and *Apocalypse of Paul* 36. Also, in *Revelation* 3.3, the lack of repentance is punished in the same manner as theft.

³⁹ *Icaromenippus* 21, *Testament of Abraham* 12.23-33, *Testament of Jacob* 8.3, *Apocalypse of Adam* 83.25-84.3, *4Ezra* 11.42,45, *2Baruch* 83.21 and *Apocalypse of Peter* 12. Also, in *2Enoch* 46.1-3, flattery is presented as a form of lie.

⁴⁰ *2Enoch* 10.4-6, 34.1-3, 46.2 and 63.4, *Revelation* 3.9-10, 21.8,27 and 22.15, and *Shepherd of Hermas* 28.2-4, 38.3-6, 65.5-6 and 92.3.

⁴¹ *Icaromenippus* 21 and 30, *Necyomantia* 11, *2Enoch* 4-6, *Apocalypse of Abraham* 31.2, *Testament of Levi* 14.7, *2Baruch* 73.4-5, *3Baruch* 13.4, *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.3-4, 65.5-6, 73.2-3 and 100.2, *Testament of Isaac* 7.10-11, *Testament of Jacob* 8.3, *Questions of Bartholomew* 4.38,42,44 and 5.2-4, *Apocalypse of Paul* 16 and 31, *Book of Thomas the Contender* 142.28-143.8, *4Ezra* 7.24-25,37-38,79-87 and 8.55-62, and *Apocalypse of Peter* 28.

⁴² *2Enoch* 50.4 and *Shepherd of Hermas* 27.3.

⁴³ *Icaromenippus* 29-30, *Gnostic Apocalypse of Paul* 20.6-21.23, *2Enoch* 44.1-3, *3Baruch* 13.4, *Shepherd of Hermas* 14.3, 33.3-7, 34.4-8, 75.4, 92.3 and 100.2-3, *Testament of Isaac* 7.9-11 and 8.11-12, *Apocalypse of Paul* 31 and *2Baruch* 37,39.

⁴⁴ *Shepherd of Hermas* 36.5.

- Arrogance: This powerful immoral value is also presented as an important example to be avoided in many texts⁴⁵ and, especially, in *Necyomantia* and *Shepherd of Hermas*,⁴⁶ while its avoidance is worthy of rewards as well.⁴⁷
- Violence: This is closely related to oppression, assault and enslavement. Many writers criticize the impact which they have in society,⁴⁸ while in the same manner they appear to praise the rewards of non-violence.⁴⁹
- Injustice: The unjust behavior of the individual against his/her fellow men is punishable in some texts,⁵⁰ while in others its avoidance is rewarded,⁵¹ Also, in *4Ezra* and *Necyomantia*, injustice is presented in the form of ingratitude.⁵²
- Hatred: Also referred to as malevolence and resentment in several texts, hatred is a particularly unethical thought that leads to immoral deeds,⁵³ while in *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.10 he who does not hate is rewarded.
- Envy: This immoral way of thinking and behaving is also punishable in many texts,⁵⁴ and its avoidance is worth of rewards⁵⁵.

⁴⁵ *Icaromenippus* 29-30, *Book of the Watchers* 5.4, *2Enoch* 10.4-6, 63.4, *Testament of Levi* 14.5-7, *Testament of Isaac* 7.9-11, *Book of Thomas the Contender* 142.1-2, *Apocalypse of Adam* 83.24-84.3, *4Ezra* 8.49-51, *2Baruch* 67.2,7-8, and *Apocalypse of Paul* 24 and 44.

⁴⁶ *Necyomantia* 5, 11-12 and 19, and *Shepherd of Hermas* 1.8, 38.3-6, 75.1 and 99.1-4.

⁴⁷ *Apocalypse of Paul* 28 and *Shepherd of Hermas* 36.5.

⁴⁸ *Necyomantia* 19, *Odyssey* XI 580-581, *Republic* 615b-c, *Aeneid* VI 609, *Frogs* 149, *Gnostic Apocalypse of Peter* 79.12-22, *Similitudes of Enoch* 46.7, *2Enoch* 34.1-3, 50.5 and 52.8, *Apocalypse of Abraham* 31.2-4, *Testament of Levi* 16.2, *Testament of Abraham* 6-10,13-14, *Apocalypse of Zephaniah* 3.12-13, *Apocalypse of Paul* 39, *Poimandres* 23, *4Ezra* 8.58-62 and 11.40-45, *2Baruch* 48.37-39 and 73.4-5, and *Apocalypse of Peter* 27.

⁴⁹ *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.10-12 and *Apocalypse of Paul* 14.

⁵⁰ *Necyomantia* 19, *Republic* 615b-c, *Aeneid* VI 609, *Frogs* 147, *Apocalypse of Paul* 35 and *2Baruch* 64.2-3.

⁵¹ *2Enoch* 9.1.

⁵² *4Ezra* 8.60-62 and *Necyomantia* 16, in which it is mentioned as a feature of the rich.

⁵³ *Aeneid* VI 608, *2Enoch* 10.4-6, 52.8, *Testament of Levi* 16.2, *Shepherd of Hermas* 7.1, 38.3-4 and 92.3, *Testament of Isaac* 7.9-11, *Apocalypse of Paul* 16, *4Ezra* 7.79-80 and 11.42-45, and *2Baruch* 73.4-5.

⁵⁴ *Gnostic Apocalypse of Paul* 20.6-21.23, *2Enoch* 10.4-6, *3Baruch* 13.4, *Shepherd of Hermas* 73.4-5, *Testament of Isaac* 7.9-11, *Poimandres* 23 and *2Baruch* 48.37-39.

⁵⁵ *Dialogue of the Savior* 138,17-20.

- Power: The desire to gain power over his/her fellow men is displayed as rather unethical in some texts,⁵⁶ which could lead those who deny or renounce it to salvation.⁵⁷
- Deceit: This last role model of this category is located in *Testament of Levi* 16.3-5, *4Ezra* 11.40-45 and *Shepherd of Hermas* 28.2-3, 38.5-6 and 92.3.

As far as the role models of the second category are concerned, the following can be found:

- Lack of Knowledge: Lack or denial of knowledge and wisdom is a punishable model common among several texts.⁵⁸
- Fear: Cowardice concerning the worship and complying with Divine Law is a rather serious crime which leads to condemnation and punishments in some texts,⁵⁹ while in *Shepherd of Hermas* 39.12 and 76.3 those who do not hesitate in front of the threats and the dangers that come against them are rewarded.
- Blasphemy: Also present in the form of hubris and sacrilege, blasphemy is one of the major unethical stances against religion, which justifies the punishment of those who act accordingly in many texts.⁶⁰
- Infidelity: Probably the most powerful role model of this category, lack or denial of faith very often appears as a punishable deed in many texts.⁶¹

⁵⁶ *Icaromenippus* 25, *Republic* 615c-616a, *Similitudes of Enoch* 38.5 and 46.4, *Apocryphal Apocalypse of John* 24 and *4Ezra* 11.40-45.

⁵⁷ *Dialogue of the Savior* 129.13-16.

⁵⁸ *De genio Socratis* 591f-592b, *Sophia of Jesus Christ* III.117.13-16, *Dialogue of the Savior* 134.1-25, *Zostrianos* 131.21-25, *Eugnostos* 74.5-8, *Shepherd of Hermas* 53.4, *2Baruch* 51.4 and *Jubilees* 23.11,19.

⁵⁹ *Icaromenippus* 15, *Revelation* 21.8, *Shepherd of Hermas* 14.5, 39.6 and 98.3-4, and *Apocryphon of James* 6.15-17.

⁶⁰ *Icaromenippus* 16, 24, 30-32, *Apocryphon of John* 31.35-38, *Book of the Watchers* 27.2, *Apocalypse of Abraham* 31.2-4, *Testament of Levi* 14.4-7, *Revelation* 16.8-11,21, *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.3-4, 62.2-3 and 96.1-3, *Questions of Bartholomew* 4.42 and 5.2-4, *2Baruch* 64.2-3, and *Apocalypse of Peter* 22 and 28; also, in *3Baruch* 2.6-7 and 3.5-8, those who build the tower of Babel and those who advise them to build it are being punished for committing hubris.

⁶¹ *Similitudes of Enoch* 41.2, 45.2 and 46.7, *2Enoch* 34.1-3, 44.1-5 and 46.1-3, *Testament of Levi* 4.1, *Apocalypse of Zephaniah* 1.14, *Vita Adae et Evae* 28.10, *Revelation* 21.8, *Shepherd of Hermas* 14.2, 15.1,3, 74.1-4, 75.4, 92.3, 103.3 and 105.4, *Apocryphal Apocalypse of John* 21, *Questions of Bartholomew* 5.2-4, *Apocalypse of Paul* 15-16, 32, 39 and 41-42, *Book of Thomas the Contender* 142.28-143.11, *Asclepius* 12, *4Ezra* 7.17,24-25,37-38, 8.58-62 and 11.40,45, *2Baruch* 82.5,9, *Apocalypse of Peter* 34 and *Jubilees* 23.18. Furthermore, in *Book of the Watchers*, the condemnation of infidelity is scattered throughout the narrative, while in *Apocalypse of Paul* 40, the punishment of charity that is not combined with faith reveals the gravitas of this particular offence. This last motif constitutes a certain apocalyptic *topos*, which presents the punishment of those who possess knowledge and wisdom but choose not to follow or propagate it; this particular behavior most probably originates from the general skepticism against religion in Late Antiquity – on this matter, see Bauckham, *Fate*, 226-230.

- Lawlessness: Closely related to infidelity, the lack of obedience to Divine Law is reported as a separate immoral value that leads to serious punishments.⁶²
- Idolatry: Another deed closely related to infidelity, this model of unethical deed leads to punishments in many texts.⁶³
- Witchcraft: Witchcraft, magic, necromancy and astrology are deeds which are regarded as punishable due to their relation to idolatry.⁶⁴
- Denial / Lack of Repentance: Except for its aforementioned positive value, the importance of repentance is also manifested through the condemnations that await those who deny it in some texts,⁶⁵ especially in *Revelation* and *Shepherd of Hermas*.⁶⁶

The examples to be avoided that characterize the relationship of the individual with money are:

- Venality: It is mentioned as a punishable deed in *Icaromenippus* 16 and *Aeneid* VI 621-622.
- Usury: Another form of unethical relationship between the individual and money, which is mentioned in several texts.⁶⁷
- Avarice: The desire for money is reported as a model to be avoided in *De sera numinis vindicta* 566f, *Icaromenippus* 25 and 30, *Necyomantia* 2 and 5, and *Apocalypse of Paul* 37.

⁶² *Somnium Scipionis* 29, *Apocalypse of Zephaniah* 3.15-18, *Shepherd of Hermas* 14.1,4 and 73.6, *Apocalypse of Paul* 36 and 39, *4Ezra* 7.20,22-25,37-38,72,79-87 and 8.55-62, and *2Baruch* 15.6, 51.4-6, 54.14,17 and 82.6.

⁶³ *Similitudes of Enoch* 46.7 and 65.6,10-11, *2Enoch* 10.4-6 and 34.1-3, *Apocalypse of Abraham* 26.3-4, *3Baruch* 13.4, *Revelation* 2.14-15,19-22, 9.20-21, 21.8 and 22.15, *Shepherd of Hermas* 75.1-3 and 98.3-4, *Apocryphal Apocalypse of John* 21, *Testament of Jacob* 8.3, *Questions of Bartholomew* 4.38,42 and 5.2-4, *2Baruch* 64.2-3, 66.2, 67.2-8 and 83.19, and *Apocalypse of Peter* 6 and 33, in which idolatry is not mentioned clearly, but is implied.

⁶⁴ *Similitudes of Enoch* 65.6,10-11, *2Enoch* 10.4-6, *Revelation* 9.20-21, 18.23-24, 21.8 and 22.15, *Testament of Jacob* 8.3, *Questions of Bartholomew* 4.38,42, *Apocalypse of Paul* 38, *2Baruch* 66.2-7 and *Apocalypse of Peter* 12.

⁶⁵ *Similitudes of Enoch* 50.4, *Apocalypse of Zephaniah* 1.5 and *Apocalypse of Paul* 24.

⁶⁶ *Revelation* 2.5-7,20-23, 3.3, 9.20-21 and 16.8-11, and *Shepherd of Hermas* 13.5, 15.6, 25.7, 39.6, 53.4, 72.4-6, 73.3,5, 74.2-5, 75.4, 96.2, 97.4, 98.4, 99.4, 100.3,5 and 103.5-6,8.

⁶⁷ *Icaromenippus* 16, *Necyomantia* 2, 5 and 11-12, *Apocalypse of Zephaniah* 3.14, *Apocalypse of Paul* 37 and *Apocalypse of Peter* 31.

- Wealth: As the most guilt-laden offence of this category, wealth is punished in several texts,⁶⁸ and, mostly, in *Shepherd of Hermas*,⁶⁹ in which those who deny it or use it to help others are rewarded.⁷⁰

Finally, the unethical deeds and thoughts that are associated with vices and passions are the following:

- Salacity: The general conviction of vices and final condemnation of those who surrender themselves to them are located in many narratives,⁷¹ while in *Shepherd of Hermas* 36.5,10 rewards are set for those who stay clear from them.
- Adultery: One of the most frequently mentioned role models of this category.⁷²
- Vanity: In some texts, vanity is considered as being one of those unethical ways of thought that deserve to be punished.⁷³
- Gluttony: In *Icaromenippus* 29, *Apocalypse of Paul* 34 and *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.3-4 and 45.1-3 this vice is referred to as an example to be avoided, while in *Shepherd of Hermas* 36.5 those who do not engage in it are regarded as worthy of reward.

⁶⁸ *Necyomantia* 2, 11, 16 and 19, *Similitudes of Enoch* 46.7, *Revelation* 3.15-18 and 18.2-3, *Apocalypse of Paul* 37, *2Baruch* 83.17, *Apocalypse of Peter* 30 and *Jubilees* 23.21. See, also, Allison, "Ethics" 299-301 and Bauckham, *Fate*, 103-108, especially 106-107, for the connection between wealth and immoral deeds within the work of Lucian, in which it represents a common belief among the civilizations of southeastern Mediterranean.

⁶⁹ *Shepherd of Hermas* 1.8, 14.5-7, 17.6, 38.3-4, 45.1-3, 62.2-3, 65.5-6, 75.1-4, 97.1-4 and 107.4.

⁷⁰ *Shepherd of Hermas* 36.5,10, 50.8-11 and 51.9-10.

⁷¹ *De sera numinis vindicta* 565d-e, *De genio Socratis* 591d-e and 592a, *Icaromenippus* 30, *Necyomantia* 5, *Somnium Scipionis* 29, *Shepherd of Hermas* 63.3, *Questions of Bartholomew* 4.44, *Apocalypse of Paul* 15-16, *Poimandres* 18 and 19, *Asclepius* 28 and *2Baruch* 48.37-39, 73.4-5 and 83.15,18.

⁷² *Icaromenippus* 15, 16, 21 and 31, *Necyomantia* 11, *Aeneid* VI 612, *2Enoch* 10.4-6, *Testament of Levi* 14.5-7, *3Baruch* 13.4, *Testament of Abraham* 10.11-12 and 12.30-33, *Shepherd of Hermas* 29.1-11, 38.3-4, 45.1-3 and 65.5-6, *Testament of Isaac* 7.8,11, *Testament of Jacob* 8.3, *Questions of Bartholomew* 4.38,44, *Apocalypse of Paul* 15-16, 18, 31, 34, 36, 38 and 50, *Gospel of Mary* 7.13-22, *2Baruch* 64.2-3, *Apocalypse of Peter* 24 and *Jubilees* 23.14. See, also, Himmelfarb, *Tours of Hell*, 69-75; sins of sexual nature, like those associated with speech, are the most frequently reported in apocalyptic literature and are heavily punished, precisely due to the secrecy that surrounds them (73).

⁷³ *Icaromenippus* 29, *Necyomantia* 12, *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.5-6, *Apocalypse of Paul* 43, *4Ezra* 7.22,25 and 9.22, and *2Baruch* 83.14.

- Greed: This important role model could not fail to appear in ~~be missing from~~ this category, as several texts refer to both the punishments which follow it⁷⁴ and the rewards which follow those who are not affected by it.⁷⁵
- Prostitution: One of the major human vices, it is condemned in several texts,⁷⁶ especially in *Revelation*.⁷⁷
- Lust: This is a basic immoral way of thinking and acting, in the sense that it leads to adultery and prostitution. It is mentioned in several narratives,⁷⁸ mostly in *Shepherd of Hermas*,⁷⁹ which also contains the most references to the salvation that comes through detachment from it.⁸⁰
- Sodomy: It is mentioned as an example to be avoided in some texts, along with homosexuality,⁸¹
- Drunkenness: This last role model of this category is reported by some writers as a deed worthy of punishment.⁸² On the other hand, in *Shepherd of Hermas* 36.5 detachment from drunkenness leads to salvation.

In conclusion, some of the most rarely mentioned positive role models are good money management,⁸³ freedom,⁸⁴ joy⁸⁵ and courage⁸⁶: while on the other hand some of the most rarely

⁷⁴ *Necyomantia* 2, *Republic* 619b-c, *Aeneid* VI 610-611, *Testament of Levi* 14.5, *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.5-6 and 65.5-6, *Questions of Bartholomew* 4.38 and *Poimandres* 23.

⁷⁵ *Shepherd of Hermas* 36.5.

⁷⁶ *Necyomantia* 11, *Testament of Levi* 14.5, *3Baruch* 13.4, *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.3-4, *Testament of Jacob* 8.3 and *Apocalypse of Paul* 39.

⁷⁷ *Revelation* 2.14-15, 19-22, 9.20-21, 14.8, 17.1-2, 18.2-3, 21.8 and 22.15.

⁷⁸ *Gnostic Apocalypse of Paul* 20.6-21.23, *Similitudes of Enoch* 67.8, 10, 13, *2Enoch* 34.1-3, *Testament of Isaac* 7.10-11, *Book of Thomas the Contender* 141.30-35 and *2Baruch* 83.18.

⁷⁹ *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.5-6, 90.8-9 and 92.3.

⁸⁰ *Shepherd of Hermas* 36.5 and 91.1-2.

⁸¹ *2Enoch* 10.4-6, *Testament of Isaac* 9.6, *Testament of Jacob* 8.3, *Apocalypse of Paul* 39 and *Apocalypse of Peter* 32.

⁸² *3Baruch* 13.4, *Revelation* 17.1-2, *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.3-4 and 65.5-6, and *Questions of Bartholomew* 4.44.

⁸³ *Necyomantia* 13.

⁸⁴ *De sera numinis vindicta* 567f-568a.

⁸⁵ *Shepherd of Hermas* 42.4 and 92.2.

⁸⁶ *Shepherd of Hermas* 38.10-11 and 76.3.

mentioned negative role models are doubt and division,⁸⁷ pedophilia,⁸⁸ incest,⁸⁹ sorrow,⁹⁰ transfer of sins,⁹¹ laziness,⁹² injudiciousness⁹³ and lack of circumcision.⁹⁴

One of the first conclusions which derive from this examination is that all of the aforementioned role models can be traced within every work of a philosophical or religious nature, literary or otherwise. This realization is absolutely logical in the sense that apocalyptic texts are part of the literary family that they belong to, products of the same mentality which brought forth every textual creation that comprises it. Bearing in mind that the context of apocalyptic texts is, almost exclusively, based on religion and philosophy, as well as that moral advice and ethical teachings are the main goal of every religious and philosophical work, it becomes clear that apocalyptic texts share the same purpose as any other work of their literary tradition: the persuasion of the faithful recipients concerning the superiority of the moral way of life against the inferior and punishable unethical thoughts and actions.⁹⁵ In order to achieve this, apocalyptic literature displays a distinct way of approach, presenting a type of discourse which relies on more than eloquence, as images and motifs appeal directly to the emotions and creativity of the religious mind, constituting a more effective way for the fulfilment of this common purpose.

⁸⁷ *Shepherd of Hermas* 15.1-3, 73.1-3, 74.3-5, 75.4 and 98.1-4, and *Apocalypse of Paul* 31.

⁸⁸ *2Enoch* 10.4-6 and *Testament of Isaac* 7.8,11.

⁸⁹ *Aeneid* VI 623-624.

⁹⁰ *Shepherd of Hermas* 92.3; the elimination of sorrow is presented as an example to be imitated in 42.4.

⁹¹ *De sera numinis vindicta* 567d-e. The effect of this punishment on the ancient mind is most clearly reflected in the words of Rainer Hirsch-Luipold (2016. "Afterlife and Reincarnation in Plutarch", Paper presented at Philo of Alexandria SBL Annual Meeting, San Antonio, Texas, November 20-21): "It is difficult to imagine a more horrifying scenario in the context of ancient shame culture: the parents stand naked with all their offenses before their children who in their lives had to suffer punishment for all of their parents' disgraceful deeds; they have no opportunity to hide but are left defenseless to the charges of their own children" (7).

⁹² *Icaromenippus* 29 and *Revelation* 3.15-20.

⁹³ *Icaromenippus* 29, *Republic* 619b-c and *Shepherd of Hermas* 92.3 and 99.1-3.

⁹⁴ *2Baruch* 66.5-7.

⁹⁵ See, indicatively, Easton, Burton S. 1932. "New Testament Ethical Lists", *JBL* 51.1, 1-12, Wibbing, Siegfried 1959. *Die Tugend- und Lasterkataloge im Neuen Testament und ihre Traditionsgeschichte unter besonderer Berücksichtigung der Qumran-Texte* [BZNW 25], Berlin: Töpelmann, and Charles, Daryl J. 2000. "Virtue and Vice Lists", *Dictionary of New Testament Background: A Compendium of Contemporary Biblical Scholarship* (edited by Stanley E. Porter Jr. and Craig A. Evans), Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 1252-1257, with related bibliography, for the catalogues of virtues and vices in Christian texts, as well as their Jewish and ancient Greek influences. Furthermore, see York, Michael 2016. *Pagan Ethics: Paganism as a World Religion*, London: Springer, for a highly interesting study on the impact of ancient Greek ethics on Christianity and modern philosophy.

However, this convergence between apocalyptic literature and the rest of religious and philosophical texts goes much deeper as far as the presence and use of role models are concerned. The comparison between these two types of role models, with respect to the variety and frequency of their reference, shows very clearly that the negative ones are much greater in number and more frequently mentioned than the positive ones. This predominance of negativity extends over the whole body of the texts and narratives, including images and motifs that are used to describe rewards in Heaven and punishments in Hell. This phenomenon is in perfect accordance with what applies to the moral teachings of many other religious and philosophical works, as the most frequent reference of unethical role models and negative imagery characterizes moral teaching not only among Jewish and Christian texts, but classical works, as well.⁹⁶ The purpose behind this preference of negative imagery and pessimistic speech is based on the conviction that ethical role models are more easily imitated after the presentation and rejection of the immoral ones. The openness of the recipients to the positive examples of life is highly dependent on their denial of the negative ones; in other words, the road to Heaven comes through the avoidance of the road that leads to Hell.⁹⁷

The presence of role models within the apocalyptic narrative reveals the true purpose of the texts in general, that is, the persuasion of the recipients to follow the moral path of life in order to gain entrance to Heaven and its rewards, but, mostly, to avoid Hell and eternal punishments that await those who think and act unethically. As works of a religious and philosophical nature, these texts do not just refer to morality as something of a secondary value, but their narrative is built around it in its entirety. ‘Apocalyptic was essentially ethical’, as Robert H. Charles notes,⁹⁸ another

⁹⁶ See Fiori, Emiliano 2016. “Death and Judgement in the *Apocalypse of Paul*: Old Imagery and Monastic Reinvention”, *ZAC* 20.1, 82-108, especially 101-103: during the fourth century CE, Judgement and Punishment constitute the heart of Christian Discipline. Furthermore, See Henning, Meghan 2014. *Educating Early Christians through the Rhetoric of Hell: “Weeping and Gnashing of Teeth” as Paideia in Matthew and the Early Church*, Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, for a very interesting study on the presence, role and use of the Hell motif as a pedagogic tool of Christian education, as well as Henning, Meghan 2013. “Eternal Punishment as Paideia: The Ekphrasis of Hell in the Apocalypse of Peter and the Apocalypse of Paul”, *BR* 58, 29-48, for the presence of this motif among the classical works.

⁹⁷ The success of this method is based upon the provocation of specific powerful emotions as fear of impending judgement and sympathy towards the condemned and tortured: ‘Hell...tended increasingly to crowd paradise out of our tradition...because it was thought pedagogically more effective to warn people with pictures of punishment in hell than to attract them with pictures of reward in heaven...’ (Bauckham, *Fate*, 94).

⁹⁸ Charles, Robert H. 1964 (ed.). *The Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha of the Old Testament in English, with Introductions and Critical and Explanatory Notes to the Several Books, Volume 2: Pseudepigrapha*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, ix.

type of literature which gathers, assembles and organizes all the features and tools that will help it to fulfil its purpose and destiny, that is to teach and instruct its faithful followers about the righteous way of life, or, as Wayne A. Meeks observes:

‘...if we make the effort to enter into the world that the apocalyptic seers imagine, it becomes apparent that they are passionately concerned, even obsessed, with the possibility of goodness. If their strongest images depict rampant evil, those images set in relief the desired and promised good, which can be obtained, the visionaries believe, only if the strategies recommended in these books are adopted by those who are chosen.’⁹⁹

⁹⁹ Meeks, W. A. 2000. “Apocalyptic Discourse and Strategies of Goodness”, *JR* 80.3, 461-475, 462.